THE POSITIONALITY OF INDIGENOUS STUDIES IN THE ONGOING EDUCATION REFORM

Eric Joyce DC. Grande
University of the Philippines Los Baños
edgrande@up.edu.ph

Abstract— My paper is an exploratory meta-analysis or meta-narrative of Indigenous Studies (IS). Data include theses and dissertations, abstracts of paper presentations, proceedings of a seminar workshop that got published into a book, few journal articles, relevant policy papers, etc., within 2012-1017. However, I focused on the 521 abstracts of paper presentations in six conferences within 2016-2017. These were surveyed for content analysis and reviewed for discourse analysis. More specifically, my paper (1) situates IS within recent global, regional, and national education policies, (2) reports emerging trajectories in terms of topics, methods, and approaches; and (3) proposes a typology of Indigenous Peoples Education (IPEd). These broad categories respectively represent IPEd as a means that advance colonization, mainstream in the ongoing education reform, marginal experience in specific contexts, and materiality of hybridity.

Keywords— Indigenous Studies, Indigenous Knowledge Systems and Practices, Indigenous Peoples Education, discourse, policy, practice, theory

INTRODUCTION

Any academic discipline or discourse is fundamentally constituted by theory, policy, and practice (Flor, 2017). Generally, these threefold functions are apparent in Indigenous Studies (IS). More specifically, my paper often refers to Indigenous Knowledge Systems and Practices (IKSP) and Indigenous Peoples Education (IPEd). In fact, both are sanctioned and enshrined in policy papers such as Republic Acts (RA), Department Orders (DO), Administrative Orders (AO), and others. In line with this, global, regional, and national policies that privilege indigenous knowledge are discussed. These include Sustainable Development Goals (SDG), Association of South East Asian Nations Work Plan for Education (ASEAN-WPE), and a few relevant Department of Education Orders (DO).

Meanwhile, researches, such as the ones surveyed and analyzed for this paper, represent practice. These embody the various epistemologies and methodologies employed in IS. However, neither IS nor IKSP/IPEd has been deeply and widely theorized. It is imperative for advocates, practitioners, and scholars to explore this theoretical dimension of a rapidly growing multidisciplinary and multifaceted discourse.

With 521 abstracts of papers presentations in relevant conferences within 2016-2017, my paper (1) situates the privileged position of IS in recent global, regional, and national policies; (2) report trajectories or trends in IPEd studies in terms of topics or focus, methods, and approaches, and (3) propose a typology of recurrent perspectives or propositions on IPEd. Data are mainly textual in nature; hence, the abstracts were subjected to content (quantitative) and discourse (qualitative) analyses. Hopefully, the proposed typology can initiate or necessitate a conceptualization of IS that may lead to a theory.

Generally, IS partly evolved from the extensive engagement of academic institutions on issues affecting the Indigenous Peoples (IP). Certain universities in Latin America: Mexico, Peru, Bolivia, Ecuador and Argentina (Cunningham, 2013); Canada (Settee, 2013); and United States of America (Stamatopoulou, 2013) are examples. They addressed "landlessness, land scarcity, shrinking of indigenous territories, land grabbing, unemployment, food sufficiency, malnourishment, HIV, drugs, ecosystem management, biodiversity, and climate change" (Gonzales, 2013, p.65). Meanwhile, the Cordillera Studies Center (CSC) of the University of the Philippines Baguio (UPB) has five priority areas: governance and public policy, material culture, sustainability science, climate change, and local languages and literatures. Rovillos and Pamintuan-Riva (2013) historicize that, in the Philippines, the term IP was popularized by the Indigenous Peoples Rights Act (IPRA) of 1997, which was eventually fortified by the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP) in 2007.

The 2nd International Conference on Cordillera Studies of UPB in July 2017 has included various topics such as traditional narratives in historical reconstruction, representation of IPs in orthodox histories, IPs in old and new orthographies, indigenous rituals in contemporary times, oral traditions and worldviews, traditional literature and literature beyond oral traditions, codification of indigenous languages, the indigenous in media and other cultural forms, endangered heritage and cultural preservation, sovereignty and self-determination, resource management and economic development, indigenous science (ethnomathematics, ethnobotany, ethnoecology), indigenous concepts of health and wellness, indigenous education, indigenous women and indigenous masculinities, indigenous in diaspora, spirituality

and religious experience in indigenous societies, indigenous and western frameworks and methodologies, and formation of area studies. In a way, these suggest what specific thematic areas that constitute IS.

Bacdayan (2017), one of the keynote speakers in the said conference, provides an operational definition and a long-term aspiration of IS:

Indigenous Studies is, though not exclusively, about generating and expanding knowledge and understanding of cultures that are often on the cusp of disappearance due to assault by modernizing influences from the outside. Just as often, the bearers of these cultures are marginalized, demeaned, and misunderstood as "other" in their national settings... [It has] humanitarian, scientific, and policy implications... [B]y the knowledge and understanding it builds and disseminates, [it] could go a long way toward smoothing the path of indigenous groups like the Igorots toward meaningful and fulfilling participation in the mainstream (i.e., national society). This would not only add significantly to the cultural endowment of the nation but also potentially enrich and strengthen the social fabric of the country. Further it will liberate the national groups of the curse of an attitude of superiority and exclusivism and foster in its stead the spirit of equality, tolerance, and goodwill. [Hence], it is greatly important for countries like the Philippines and deserves generous support (p. 22).

A. Policy

In terms of policy, it is instructive to start with the global arena. In 2015, the members of the United Nations launched the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG) as an articulation of targets that aim to improve the quality of life within 2015-2030. It is essentially an expanded continuation of the Millennium Development Goals (MDG) in 2000-2015. This has become the basis of many national governments all over the world in designing their development plans. Interestingly, SDG recognizes the indigenous peoples as a vulnerable sector of society. The document envisions to empower them so that they can fully participate in society.

SDG only has one goal that pertains to education. Goal 4 states "ensure inclusive and equitable quality education and promote lifelong opportunities for all" (UN, 2015, n.p.). Booth and Ainscow (2016) explain that "inclusion is most importantly about putting inclusive values into action" (p. 9). In the recently concluded 6th Archives Congress, National Archives of the Philippines Director Victorino Mapa (2018) underscored that inclusion is a deliberate means of addressing marginalization. While the latter implies the loss of opportunities, the former signifies renewal of opportunities. His address essentially refers to the value of archiving not only historical documents but, more importantly, preserving

the data, information, knowledge, or wisdom contained in these.

Further, SDG contains more specific targets that recognize the value of culture and indigenous, local, or traditional knowledge in the attainment of sustainable development as follows:

Goal 2.5. By 2020, maintain the genetic diversity of seeds, cultivated plants and farmed and domesticated animals and their related wild species, including through soundly managed and diversified seed and plant banks at the national, regional and international levels, and promote access to and fair and equitable sharing of benefits arising from the utilization of genetic resources and associated traditional knowledge, as internationally agreed

Goal 4.7. By 2030, ensure that all learners acquire the knowledge and skills needed to promote sustainable development, including, among others, through education for sustainable development and sustainable lifestyles, human rights, gender equality, promotion of a culture of peace and non-violence, global citizenship and appreciation of cultural diversity and of culture's contribution to sustainable development

Goal 11.4. Strengthen efforts to protect and safeguard the world's cultural and natural heritage.

Within the Association of South East Asian Nations (ASEAN), a regional roadmap for education is in place. It is called the ASEAN Work Plan for Education (WPE). Interestingly, it recognizes the value of indigenous knowledge. It does not only rationalize but also harmonize all initiatives pertaining to education. It has the following key elements:

1. Promote ASEAN awareness through strengthening of Southeast Asian history and indigenous knowledge;
2. Enhance the quality and access to basic education for all, including the disabled, less-advantageous, and other marginalized groups;
3. Strengthen the use of Information and Communication Technology (ICT);
4. Support the development of Technical-Vocational Education and Training (TVET) sector as well as lifelong learning in the region;
5. Complement the efforts of other sectors in meeting the objectives of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD);
6. Strengthen the higher education sector through the implementation of robust quality assurance (QA) mechanisms;

7. Foster the role of higher education in socio-economic development through University-Industry Partnership; and

8. Provide capacity building programs for teachers, academics, and other key stakeholders in the education community (ASEAN Secretariat, 2016).

At the national level, the Department or Education issued several orders (DO) that privilege local, indigenous, or traditional knowledge. Some of these are as follows:

1. DO No. 62, s. 2011 Adopting the National Indigenous Peoples Education Policy Framework;

2. DO No. 103, s. 2011 Creation of Indigenous Peoples Education Office;

3. DO No. 32, s. 2015 Adopting the Indigenous Peoples Education Curriculum Framework;

4. DO No. 212, s. 2016 Reiterating the Role of the Indigenous Peoples Education Office;

5. DO No. 3, s. 2017 Multi-Year Implementation Guidelines on the Allocation and Utilization of Indigenous Peoples Education Program Support Fund; and

6. DO No. 33, s. 2017 Roles and Responsibilities of the Indigenous Peoples Education Focal Persons at the Regional and Schools Division Levels.

B. Research

Higher Education Institutions (HEI) in the Philippines have research as one of their functions together with instruction, extension, and production. However, recently, the Department of Education also issued orders on research. Hence, these suggests that research is also becoming a mandate of basic education:

1. DO No. 39, s. 2016 Adoption of the Basic Education Research Agenda; and

2. DO No. 16, s. 2017 Research Management Guidelines

The former identifies the research priorities: (1) Teaching and Learning, (2) Child Protection, (3) Human Resource Development, and (4) Governance. These cut across three themes: (1) Gender and Development, (2) Disaster Risk Reduction and Management, and (3) Inclusive Education (DepEd, 2016). The latter articulates guidelines on how research is undertaken and managed at the national, regional, division, and school levels. This ultimately seek to advance the research culture in education (DepEd 2017). The guidelines also indicate how DepEd constituents can avail of a grant.

In the researches within 2016-2017 that were reviewed, IPEd is interchangeably used with *community-based education* (Gonzales, 2013), *heritage education* (Gonzales-De Castro, 2017), *indigenized education* (Fabelico, Subong, Diaz, Dupingay, and Liclican, 2016), *teaching indigenous peoples* (Dela Paz-Daquioag and Corpuz, 2016), and *tribal schools* (Tomaquin and Tomaquin-Malong, 2016). Meanwhile, the emphasis of the National Commission for Culture and the Arts or (NCCA) on *cultural education* or *culture-based education* is rationalized by RA No. 10066 or the Cultural Heritage Law of 2009, which preceded DO 62, s. 2011 being the reckoning point of my discussion. Thus, NCCA has the Philippine Cultural Education Program (PCEP) with the following mandate:

1. Ensure culture as the core and foundation of education, governance, and sustainable development;

2. Make cultural education accessible to all sectors of Philippine society, particularly the youth, teachers, artists and cultural workers, officials and employees of the government, members of the media, and civil society; and

3. Develop among Filipinos greater awareness, understanding, and appreciation of culture and arts towards the evolution of a consciousness that will improve the quality of lives.

To determine the trajectories or trends in IPEd studies in term of topics, methods, and approaches, I surveyed and analyzed 521 abstracts of paper presentations in six conferences that have to do with education within 2016-2017. These are sequenced starting with the most recent:

1. Philippine Association for Language Teaching International Conference, University of Santo Tomas, Manila, 7-9 December 2017;

2. Bantula International Conference on Culture-Based Education in the Context of ASEAN Integration, La Consolacion University Philippines, Malolos City, 1-3 December 2017;

3. 2nd International Conference on Cordillera Studies, CAP-John Hay Trade and Cultural Center, Baguio City, 12-14 July 2017;

4. 11th Nakem International Conference, Pangil Beach Resort, Currimao, Ilocos Norte, 23-25 May 2016;

5. 1st International Research Conference on Teacher Education and Indigenous Peoples Education, Hotel Roma, Tuguegarao City, 24-26 February 2016; and

6. International Conference on Inclusive Education and Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education, Waterfront-Manila Pavillion Hotel, Manila, 18-20 February 2016.

After reviewing and analyzing samples, I figured out four codes necessary in categorizing or classifying the abstracts in terms of topic or emphasis. *IKSP* refers to studies that plainly

discuss or present an IKSP as defined by the National Commission on Indigenous Peoples (NCIP) Administrative Order No. 1, s. 2012. Further, *IKSP-Ed* includes studies that discuss IKSP and are, in one way or another, explicitly related or linked to education in general. These are mainly marked by recommendations or suggestions to preserve, promote, and protect IKSP in the education system. Another code or category is *MTBMLE*. While it is essentially IPEd, I deliberately distinguished such studies because these pertain to another policy, which is DO 74, s. 2009. Besides, the policy is preoccupied with, and, therefore, limited to the language/s of instruction, interaction, and assessment. Besides, it is applicable only in Kindergarten to Grade 3. In contrast, IPEd or CBE runs across all levels: basic, technical-vocational, and higher education. Lastly, *IPEd* refers to the strategic, intentional, deliberate, and engaging (SIDE) inclusion or integration of IKSP into the education system, particularly in terms of curriculum, competencies or outcomes, and crediting system. Out of 521 entries, 302 of which is relevant. These are either IKSP, IKSP-Ed, MTBMLE, or IPEd. More specifically, 158 or (30.32%) is IKSP, 45 (8.64%) IKSP-Ed, 58 (11.13%) MTBMLE, and 41 (7.9%) IPEd. Table 1 reveals the dearth of IPEd studies, including CBE and other labels and notions. It hardly reached 10%, causes of which merit another study. While either IPEd or CBE is a new in the education system, the result calls for more strategic and intentional documentation or codification of IPEd initiatives. However, from a positive and hopeful stance, the table shows the available wealth of IKSP that can be included or contextualized into the curriculum. IKSP comprises almost a third of all the entries. This implies it is well-researched and well-represented but not harnessed for the purposes of formal, informal, or non-formal education. I move that the IKSP-Ed studies be carefully extended or expanded into experimental or action researches to complement IPEd. Meanwhile, MTBMLE can now level up by looking into content and not just the language of teaching and learning.

Table 1. Topics of the abstracts reviewed

Conference	Number of Abstracts	IKSP	IKSP-Ed	MTBMLE	IPED
PALTIC	62	2	2	3	0
Bantula IC	28	8	2	1	15
2nd ICCS	151	104	20	2	6
11th Nakem	49	14	3	14	5
1st IRCTEIPEd	194	27	16	10	15
ICIEMTBMLE	37	3	2	28	0
TOTAL	**521**	**158 (30.32%)**	**45 (8.64%)**	**58 (11.13%)**	**41 (7.9%)**

Research methods apparent in the abstracts indicate approaches to IPEd studies. These ultimately reflect ontologies, epistemologies, methodologies, teleologies, cosmologies, and other philosophical underpinnings of research. To borrow from Bacdayan (2017), these indicate (1) *what* Indigenous Studies is; (2) *who* do Indigenous Studies; and (3) *how* they do Indigenous Studies. His definition implies that, considering that IP groups have been historically "marginalized, demeaned, and misunderstood," neither IS nor IPEd is value-free. It demands a certain philosophical stance or positionality.

Out of 302 relevant entries (IKSP, IKSP-Ed, MTBMLE, and IPEd), which is more than half of all the abstracts surveyed, 64 employed quantitative method, 220 qualitative method, and 18 mixed methods. Noticeably, qualitative method overwhelmingly outnumbers quantitative and mixed methods. However, most of these are qualitative-descriptive, hence, positivist or deductive in approach. These tested the hypothesized relationship of variables, such as effect or impact, using textual or non-numerical data. IS, IKSP, and IPEd are contextual, local, and situational or situated; hence, qualitative method and/or inductive, abductive, and retroductive approaches be explored as lenses. However, this does not isolate quantitative method or deductive approach. In fact, there are initiatives that seek to develop a centralized or national database of cultural information or IKSP. With inclusive education being one of the Sustainable Development Goals (SDG), comprehensive, generalizable and conclusive measures that indicate IPEd contributes to the attainment of this goal are equally imperative.

Table 2. Research methods employed in the abstracts reviewed

Conference	Number of Abstracts	Number of Relevant Abstracts	Quantitative	Qualitative	Mixed
PALTIC	62	7	1	3	3
Bantula IC	28	26	3	22	1
2nd ICCS	151	132	13	110	9
11th Nakem IC	49	36	6	29	1
1st IRCTEIPEd	194	68	24	42	2
ICIEMTBMLE	37	33	17	14	2
TOTAL	**521**	**302**	**64 (12.28%)**	**220 (42.23%)**	**18 (3.54%)**

On one hand, quantitative researches employed survey and experiment (pilot-testing of instructional materials developed) and analyzed through frequency distributions and measures of central tendency (standardized mean). Examples of variables studied include *indigenous-ethnic identity* and *helpfulness* of an IPEd program for adolescents (Villalon, 2017); *engagement, resiliency, character,* and *learning* of students in a service learning program that teaches indigenous peoples (Dela Paz-Daquioag and Corpus, 2016); *impact* of social interventions for IP (Villanes, Saron, Laurora, Bagan, De Leon, Grajo, and Moro, 2016); 21st century and science process *skills* of prospective teachers (Fabelico et al., 2016); IP students *access to higher education* (Gonzales, 2013); *attitudes* of IP college students on the usefulness of their mother tongue (Taga, Pepito, Yambagon, and Palabrica, 2016); number of *completed and published works* (Rovillos and Pamintuan-Riva, 2013); *students' success* or *retention rate of IPs in higher education* (Settee, 2013); *perception* or *reception* of students on the nationalist content of a music curriculum (Labrador and Chua, 2016); among others.

On the other hand, the qualitative methods employed include *documentary analysis* (Ramos and Caday, 2016), *ethnography* or *participant-observation* (Abelardo, 2015; Cabazares, 2016; Calis, 2016; Imbag, 2016; Jamoral and Reyes, 2016; Tomaquin and Tomaquin-Malong, 2016; Villalon, 2017), *ethnophotography* (Ramos and Caday, 2016), a*uthoethnography* (Cunningham, 2013; Magannon, 2013; Settee, 2013; Gonzales, 2013; Stamatopoulou, 2013), *ethnography of communication* (Grande, 2016), *focus group discussion* (Taga et al., 2016), *narrative* or *storytelling* (Soga-ang and Grande, 2016; Abadiano, 2017; Gonzales-De Castro, 2017; Ngales, 2017), *interview* (Abelardo, 2015; Villanes et al., 2016), *case study* (Velasco, 2017), *critical analysis* (Lal Tabdar, 2017), *discourse analysis* (Rovillos and Pamintuan-Riva, 2013; Antivola, 2016)) *field notes* and *thick description* (Grande, 2017), among others.

Moreover, Cunningham (2013) rationalizes that IS, generally, "prefers certain methods: qualitative, participatory action research, biographical method, and engaged research;" meanwhile, preferred tools include "workshops, focus group discussions, collective interviews, and dialogues" (p. 7). Ideally, the expected outcome of IS and, in this context, IPEd, is "an action plan for immediate use in a specific territorial or local setting" (Cunningham, 2013, p. 7).

C. Propsoed Typology

While a theory of IPEd studies is desired, at least, in the Philippine context, my paper only suggests a typology. Based on the abstracts surveyed and analyzed, four perspectives or narratives on IPEd are recurring. These present IPEd as a (1) means to advance the colonial project, (2) movement privileging IP that became the mainstream in

the ongoing education reform, (3) marginal education experience in certain places and contexts, and (4) materiality of hybridity.

a. Means to advance the colonial project

This view is hinged on the unequal and uneven experiences of many IP all over the world under colonial rule. Historically, *colonialism* resulted in the dichotomy between IP and the non-IP, highlander vs. lowlander, traditional vs. Christian, ethnic vs. non-ethnic, native vs. non-native, general/national population or cultural majority vs. minority (Rovillos and Pamintuan-Riva, 2013 and Magannon, 2013). The pedagogical orientation and method of the *prayle* (friars) in educating the *indio* (native) exemplify this. The natives, for that matter, needed to be educated so that they can serve the colonizers well. The Spaniards are known for *Christianization* through Roman Catholicism, while the Americans their *benevolent assimilation* through Protestantism. Under the Americans, the goal of schooling was "to become literate in English" (Magannon, 2013, p. 13).

Unfortunately, this orientation was carried over to the independence of the Republic of the Philippines. The government-sanctioned educations system perpetuated this in the name of *integration*, that is, the cultural minorities are expected to be assimilated to the culture of the majority. Today, IP studies, which take a post-colonial or critical stance, explicitly oppose IPEd or CBE. Their contention is further intensified by the discourse of internationalization of education, which seemingly pressures IP to compete with their international or global counterparts. NCCA (2016) notes that "years of colonial education system has produced a generation of skilled, educated Filipinos but with little or no rootedness [in] culture" (p. 29). Efforts to address this, as NCCA comments, "have been so slow and derailed by so much bureaucracy". Hence, one prominent goal of education is to decolonize consciousness, which remains highly contested.

b. Mainstream in the ongoing education reform

This view refers to not only facilitating IP's access to social services but more importantly mainstreaming IKSP in all forms of learning systems. This is the track of the ongoing education reform in the Philippines. Historically, this started as random initiatives of various sectors in different geographical sites until it gained national attention and became central in the education reform. I argue that in this context, mainstreaming IPEd entails curriculum, competencies, and a crediting system. For now, this is mainly achieved through localization or the "freedom for schools or local authorities to adapt the curriculum to local conditions and relating the context of the curriculum and the process of teaching and learning to the local environment" (Taylor, 2004 in NCCA, 2016, p. 29). DepEd (2015) goes for

contextualization either through localization and indigenization. The former is a "process of learning content specified in the curriculum to local information and materials in the learner's community", while indigenizing the "process of enhancing curriculum, education resources, and teaching-learning processes in relation to the bio-geographical, historical, and socio-cultural context of the learner's community" (n.p.).

In basic education, initiatives are directed to, on one hand, the Alternative Learning Systems (ALS) being non-formal. Examples of which include those among Aetas in Quezon (Villanes et al., 2016), Calingas in Isabela (Imbag, 2016), and Mangyan in Occidental Mindoro (Jocson, 2016). On the other hand, initiatives directed to Kto12, being formal, include *cultural concepts in early childhood education* (Cabazares, 2016), *ethnomathematics in K-3 curriculum* (Calis, 2016), *implications of beliefs and practices in Kto12* (Jamoral and Reyes, 2016), and *nationalist music content/curriculum* (Labrador and Chua, 2016).

It is not surprising that HEI gained remarkable success in the development of IPEd as a field of inquiry. Their untiring initiatives, researches, and advocacies that aimed at addressing IP issues have largely influenced international, national, and local policy-making bodies. These initiatives come in the form of extension programs or organic programs. In Latin America, IPEd in HEI coexisted with "curricular reform, respect for endogenous pedagogical teaching, use of indigenous languages, and culturally acceptable teaching aids" (Cunningham, 2013, p. 1). More practically, it embedded IKSP in the curricula; established post-graduate courses, research, and scholarship programs directed to IP issues; and created indigenous universities. In Canada, IP advocates believe that, if IPEd serves the marginalized IP, it will benefit all students (Settee, 2013). As such, undergraduate programs in Native Studies and a bachelor's degree in education specializing in IPEd are in place. Recognizing the centrality of IP issues in academic life, Columbia University in New York manifests its IP persuasion through the "administration's commitment to diversity, increased recruitment and admission of IP students, constitution of IP student organizations, and also recruitment of IP faculty" (Stamatopoulou, 2013, p. 263).

In the Philippines, the University of Saint Louis (USL) in Tuguegarao City maintains a service learning program that requires students to teach IP. UPB, for instance, has CSC as a knowledge management unit (Rovillos and Pamintuan-Riva, 2013). Besides, it runs a program that affirms and develops the ethnic identity of fresh students (Villalon, 2017). The University of Santo Tomas (UST) In Manila has a Distance Education Program (DEP) that has been serving Aetas in Bamban, Tarlac (Abelardo, 2015). The Lyceum of the Philippines University (LPU), also in Manila, partners with IP communities for its extension programs

(Ngales, 2017). The University of Southeastern Philippines (USEP) has sustained the Pamulaan Center for Indigenous Peoples Education for 11 years now (Abadiano, 2017). These are just a few examples as embodied in the abstract of the paper presentations taken as samples.

c. Marginal education experience

This view articulates the sentiment of several advocates and sectors, who claim that IPEd remains theoretical. In other words, it is not a lived experience in many IP communities. For example, La Tabdar (2017) claims that the "right of IP to education as upheld by various international declarations and institutions has not been fully realized in Nepal" (n.p.). It is hoped that IPEd in Nepal will address mother tongue education, bilingualism/interculturalism, structured behavior, technical deficiencies, economic deprivation, financial resources, access and participation, and its political and social implications. However, their illiteracy rate remains high at 52.88%. Similarly, in the Summit on Cultural Protection and Development in October 2016, "participants commented that while countless policies and programs on culture have been made at both national and local levels, the gap between this discourse and actual practice remains very wide" (NCCA, 2016, p. 28).

Further, Tomaquin and Tomaquin-Malong (2016) report that IPEd in Surigao Del Sur, which takes the form of either adult education, vocational education, or basic education program, has been threatened by "military operations, harassment of tribal school officials, lack of local government unit (LGU) support, and insurgency in the countryside" (n.p.). Hence, the hope of preserving human rights and eradicating poverty with and through IPEd is diminished and threatened. Moreover, Gonzales-De Castro (2017) reports that the Handi Project, an initiative of the Save the Ifugao Rice Terraces Movement (Sitmo), was established due to the lack of focus on IPEd in the formal school curriculum. Ramos and Caday (2016) suggest that the IKSP of the Iwaks in Nueva Vizcaya remains isolated from the formal curriculum.

d. Materiality of hybridity

This view resonates the idea that IPEd is a largely inter/multicultural and inter/multidisciplinary engagement (Gonzales, 2013). In fact, it is a global or international reconstruction and sharing (Settee, 2013). IPEd cannot be isolated from other initiatives because it is hinged on the cosmology that everything and everyone is interrelated. As such, IPEd does not exclude the indigenous from the discourse of intercultural and international contexts and networks. For instance, Columbia University organizes lecture series, conferences, and meetings; engages in multidisciplinary

research; and works with other experts around the world (Stamatopoulou, 2013).

At the local context, initiatives in Paracelis, Mountain Province, for instance, do not only apply to the secondary school involved but all other schools within the ancestral domain. Besides, it is not exclusive to only one tribe but for all other tribes, who are now coexisting and geographically situated within the ancestral domain. These include the G'dang, Balangao, Bunut, some sub-tribes of Kalinga, among others. Further, the Towards Education Rights of the Mangyan (TERM)-Plan International San Jose, Occidental Mindoro did not concentrate on only one IP group but has served all seven tribes: Iraya, Taubukid, Alagan, Hanunuo, Bukid, Gubatnon, and Retagnon (Jocson, 2016). Similarly, Taga et al. (2016) covered all seven tribes in Bukidnon: Bukidnon, Higaonon, Talaandig, Manuvu, Matigsalog, Tigiwahanon, and Umayamnon in their study.

CONCLUSION

Using textual data, my paper discusses that IPEd is a segment of the broader narrative of IS. As such, IPEd can help attain the aspirations of IS in general. Initially, I presented global, regional, and national policies that privilege indigenous, local, or traditional knowledge in the ongoing education reform. Further, I showed the dearth of IPEd studies on one hand, and the wealth of IKSP studies on the other. This implies a volume of IKSP that can be carefully and appropriately harnessed for IPEd. Qualitative methods dominate the field, but these are mainly positivist or deductive in approach. Thus, the field calls for further exploration using inductive, abductive, and retroductive approaches. Lastly, IS narrativize IPEd as a (1) means to advance the colonial project, (2) movement privileging IP that became the mainstream in the ongoing education reform, (3) marginal education experience in certain places and contexts, and (4) materiality of hybridity. The articulation or search for a theory or theories of IS and IPEd remains a challenge to scholars, practitioners, and other stakeholders.

REFERENCES

Abadiano, B.D. (2017). Sustainable initiatives on Indigenous Peoples Education through

partnership and collaboration with stakeholders. 2nd International Conference of Cordillera Studies, CAP-John Hay Trade and Cultural Center, Baguio City, 12-14 July.

Abelardo, A.S. (2015). Mediation and consequences of distance education program among Aetas

of Bamban, Tarlac. Master's thesis. Quezon City: College of Education, University of the Philippines Diliman.

Antivola, M.B. (2016). Ang *orag* bilang estetika: Isang pag-uugat mula sa *Istoryang Suanog* ng

Bikol. *Talas: An Interdisciplinary Journal on Cultural Education 1* (1), pp. 84-102.

Association of South East Asian Nations. (2016). Overview of ASEAN cooperation on education. Retrieved from www.asean.org on 5 May 2017.

Bacdayan, A.S. (2017). High road to the mainstream: Indigenous studies and the Igorots of the

Cordillera Adminstrative Region (CAR). Keynote address. 2nd International Conference on Cordillera Studies, CAP-John Hay Trade and Cultural Center, Baguio City, Philippines, 12-14 July.

Booth, T. and Ainscow, M. (2016). *Index for inclusion: A guide to school development led by inclusive values*. 4th ed. Cambridge: Index for Inclusion.

Cabasares, S.T. (2016). Integrating cultural concepts in indigenous children's education:

Relevance and implication. *Talas: An Interdisciplinary Journal on Cultural Education 1* (1), pp. 36-51.

Calis, M. (2016). Ethnomathematics among Ibaloi children: Considerations for the K-3 curriculum.

International Conference on Inclusive Education and Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education, Waterfront-Manila Pavilion Hotel, Manila, 18-20 February.

Cunningham, M. (2013). Indigenous, intercultural, and community universities: Latin American experience to address education indigenous peoples. *Unsettling discourses: The theory and practice of indigenous studies.* Baguio City: Cordillera Studies Center, University of the Philippines Baguio, pp. 1-8.

Dela Paz-Daquioag, M. and Corpus, H.S. (2016). The University of Saint Louis experience of service learning in teaching indigenous people and inclusive education. 1st International Research Conference on Teacher Education and Indigenous Peoples Education, Hotel Roma, Tuguegarao City, 24-26 February.

Denzin, N. K. (2014). *Interpretive autoethnography.* 2nd ed. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage Publications, Inc.

Department of Education. (2011a). National Indigenous Peoples Education Policy Framework. Retrieved from www.deped.gov.ph on 5 May 2017.

Department or Education. (2011b). Creation of Indigenous Peoples Education Office (IPsEO). Retrieved from www.deped.gov.ph on May 2017.

Department of Education. (2015). Adopting the Indigenous Peoples Education Curriculum Framework. Retrieved from www.deped.gov.ph on 5 May 2017.

Department of Education. (2016a). Reiterating the Role of the Indigenous Peoples Education Office (IPsEO). Retrieved from www.deped.gov.ph on 5 May 2017.

Department of Education. (2016b). Adoption of the Basic Education Agenda. Retrieved from www.deped.gov.ph on 14 February 2018.

Department of Education. (2017a). Multi-Year Implementing Guidelines on the Allocation and Utilization of the Indigenous Peoples Education Program Support Fund. Retrieved from www.deped.gov.ph on 5 May 2017.

Department of Education. (2017b). Roles and Responsibilibites of the Indigenous Peoples Education Focal Persons at the Regional and Schools Division Levels. Retrieved from www.deped.gov.ph on 5 May 2017.

Department of Education. (2017c). Research Management Guidelines. Retrieved from www.deped.gov.ph on 14 February 2018.

Department of Education. (2017). *The Indigenous Peoples Education (IPEd) program.* Pasig City: Author.

Estrada J.M. and Gagrantiel, K.T. (2013). *Kto12: RA 10533 and relevant education policies.* Pasig City: Vibal Foundation.

Fabelico, F.L., Subong, J.D., Diaz, Q.A., Dupingay, R.T., and Liclican J.B. (2016). The 21st century skills and science process skills among prospective teachers of Nueva Vizcaya State University: Creating a paradigm for globally competitive indigenized science education program. 1st International Conference on Teacher Education and Indigenous Peoples Education, Hotel Roma, Tuguegarao City, 24-26 February.

Flor, A.G. (2017). Course Guide, COMM 330 Communication Policy and Planning, Second Term, AY 2016-2017, University of the Philippines Open University.

Gonzales, T. (2013). Indigenous studies in the context of *Abya Yala* (The Americas): Two experiences of indigenous higher education and/or community-based education. *Unsettling discourses: The theory and practice of indigenous studies.* Baguio City: Cordillera Studies Center, University of the Philippines Baguio, pp. 65-93.

Gonzales-De Castro, L. (2017). The Handi Project: A heritage education initiative. Abstract. 2nd International Conference on Cordillera Studies, CAP-John Hay Trade and Cultural Center, Baguio City, 12-14 July.

Grande, E.D. (2016a). A proposed framework in implementing Indigenous Peoples Education in Paracelis, Mountain Province. 1st International Research Conference on Teacher Education and Indigenous Peoples Education, Hotel Roma, Tuguegarao City, 24-26 February.

Grande, E.D. (2016b). From otherness to ownership: Indigenous Peoples Education in Paracelis, Mountain Province. 11th NAKEM International Conference, Pangil Beach Resort, Currimao, Ilocos Norte, 23-25 May.

Grande, E.D. (2016c). Advancing culture-based education: An operational model in Paracelis, Mt. Province. *Talas: An Interdisciplinary Journal in Cultural Education 1* (1), pp. 14-35.

Grande, E.D. (2017). The challenges and prospects of Indigenous Peoples Education in Paracelis, Mountain Province. Paper presentation. 2nd International Conference on Cordillera Studies, CAP-John Hay Trade and Cultural Center, Baguio City, 12-14 July.

Imbag, E.E. (2016). Indigenous-based enrichment of the DepEd ALS curriculum for the Calingas of San Mariano, Isabela. 1st International Research Conference on Teacher Education and Indigenous Peoples Education, Hotel Roma, Tuguegarao City, 24-26 February.

Jamoral, R.M. and Reyes, A.S. (2016). The implications of the beliefs and practices of the Calinga of Northern Luzon Philippines. 1st International Research Conference on Teacher Education and Indigenous Peoples Education, Hotel Roma, Tuguegarao City, 24-26 February.

Jocson, S.D. (2016). Beyond the formal classroom: Multilingual and multicultural education in Occidental Mindoro. 11th NAKEM International Conference, Pangil Beach Resort, Currimao, Ilocos Norte, 24-26 February.

Labrador, J.T. and Chua, H.L. (2016). Kto12 music curriculum in the Philippines: Grade 7 students' reception on the (nationalist) music content. *Talas: An Interdisciplinary Journal on Cultural Education 1* (1), pp. 67-82.

Lal Tabdar, P. (2017). Issues on Indigenous Peoples Education in Nepal. Abstract. 2nd International Conference on Cordillera Studies, CAP-John Hay Trade and Cultural Center, Baguio City, 12-14 July.

Magannon, E. (2013). Philippine indigenous cultural communities: A historical perspective. *Unsettling discourses: The theory and practice of indigenous studies.* Baguio City: Cordillera Studies Center, University of the Philippines Baguio, pp. 11-23.

Mapa, V.M. (2018). Keynote address. 6th Archives Congress, Radisson Blue, Cebu City, 18-20 October.

National Commission on Culture and the Arts. (2016). The summit on cultural protection and development: Adressing challenges, crafting strategies, and putting culture into the arts into the national agenda. *Agung 12* (6), pp28-33.

National Commission on Indigenous Peoples. (2012). *Administrative Order No. 1, Series of 2012: The Indigenous Knowledge Systems and Practices (IKSPs) and Customary Laws (CLs) research and documentation guidelines.* Quezon City: Author.

Ngales, M.L. (2017). Institutionalizing indigenous education among HEI's: Advancing gains in inclusivity and equity in education. 2nd International Conference on Cordillera Studies, CAP-John Hay Trade and Cultural Center, Baguio City, 12-14 July.

Ramos, B.V. and Caday, L.C. (2016). The Iwaks of Nueva Vizcaya: IKSP on health and long life, good education, and climate change. 11th NAKEM International Conference, Pangil Beach Resort, Currimao, Ilocos Norte, 24-26 May.

Rovillos, R.D. and Pamintuan-Riva, M. (2013). The 'indigenous' in the Cordillera Studies Program of the University of the Philippines Baguio. Baguio City: Cordillera Studies Center, University of the Philippines Baguio, pp, 111-120.

Sette, P. (2013). Reducing barriers to Native American students' success in higher education. *Unsettling discourses: The theory and practice of indigenous studies.* Baguio City: Cordillera Studies Center, University of the Philippines Baguio, pp. 47-61.

Soga-ang, S.A. and Grande, E.D. (2016). Implementing the Indigenous Peoples Education Policy in Anonat National Agricultural-Vocational high School, Paracelis, Mountain Province. 1st International Research Conference on Teacher Education and Indigenous Peoples Education, Hotel Roma, Tuguegarao City, 24-26 February.

Stamatopoulou, E. (2013). The role of research in academia in Indigenous Peoples issues: Interculturality in the making. *Unsettling discourses: The theory and practice of indigenous studies.* Baguio City: Cordillera Studies Center, University of the Philippines Baguio, pp. 249-272.

Taga, B.P., Pepito, R.D., Yambagon, L.B., and Palabrica, M.T. (2016). Attitudes of indigenous students towards the usefulness and place of Binulid/Minanuvo in their chosen course. International Conference on Inclusive Education and Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education, Waterfront-Manila Pavilion Hotel, Manila, 18-20 February.

Tomaquin, R.D. and Tomaquin-Malong, P. (2016). The challenges of tribal schools: The case of Surigao Del Sur. 1st International Research Conference on Teacher Education and Indigenous Peoples Education, Hotel Roma, Tuguegarao City, 24-26 February.United Nations. (2015). *Transforming our world: The 2030 agenda for sustainable development.* New York: Author.

Velasco, M.M. (2017). Teachers and indigenous community development: An Ibaloy educator in Northern Philippines. Abstract. 2nd International Conference on Cordillera Studies, CAP-John Hay Trade and Cultural Center, Baguio City, 12-14 July.

Villalon, A.R. (2017). Tawid: Teaching adolescents in working and exploring indigenous-ethnic identity development. 2nd International Conference on Cordillera Studies, CAP-John Hay Trade and Cultural Center, Baguio City, 12-14 July.

Villanes, R.M., Saron, J.R., Laurora, F.R., Bagan, R.V., De Leon, M.A., Grajo B.L., and Moro, N.D. (2016). The impact of Alternative Learning System (ALS) projects as social interventions to the lives of the Aetas in Perez, Quezon: Towards the realization of a comprehensive ALS programs for indigenous peoples. 1st International Research Conference on Teacher Education and Indigenous Peoples Education, Hotel Roma, Tuguegarao City, 24-26 February.